

April 27, 2010

Dr. Byung Bae Park Korea Forest Research Institute Department of Forest Conservation 207, Cheongyangni 2-dong Dongdaemun-gu Seoul, 130-712 Republic of South Korea

Dear Dr. Park:

Re: Manuscript No. 09-369 - Variation in mass and nutrient concentration of leaf litter across years and sites in New Hampshire northern hardwoods by Ruth D. Yanai, Mary A. Arthur, Marty Acker, and Byung Bae Park

First, I apologize for the delay in completing the review of your manuscript. There was a problem with the email and unfortunately the reviews of your paper were not received by the Associate Editor (AE). This makes my decision more difficult as the AE has indicated your manuscript is not currently acceptable for publication in the Canadian Journal of Forest Research (CJFR). Both referees and the AE agreed your paper presented some interesting and publishable results; however, the paper needed substantive revisions before it may be acceptable. One of the main concerns was in the presentation of the results. Sections were unclear, there was too much detail, some information was not synthesized appropriately, the figures need to be reworked (some could be deleted), and there were conclusions that were not supported by the results. In addition, the AE identified statistical concerns and issues related to the hypotheses. These and! other concerns are thoroughly explained in the reviews. Thus, my recommendation is your manuscript is not currently acceptable for publication in the CJFR given the number of the concerns, revisions will probably take longer than the 6 weeks allotted for major revisions and any revised paper may have to be re-reviewed. I encourage you to revise your manuscript based on the reviews and resubmit it to CJFR.

If you decide to re-submit a manuscript, please include a cover letter and describe how you have addressed the major concerns of the referees and the Associate Editor. Please find their comments attached.

You may submit your manuscript by using our on-line submission process now located at:

pubs.nrc-cnrc.gc.ca/cjfr/osprey

Please destroy all previous links. Please note: the system will assign your manuscript a new number. You should, however, list your previous manuscript number in your covering letter.

Your revised manuscript will be assessed by the Associate Editor who will recommend the amount of further review and revision necessary.

Sincerely,

Doug Maynard, Ph.D Co-editor, Canadian Journal of Forest Research