

This email is being blind copied to the referees

August 4, 2005

Dr. Ruth Yanai  
State University of New York  
College of Environmental Science & Forestry  
One Forestry Drive  
346 Illick Hall  
Syracuse, NY 13210  
United States

Dear Dr. Yanai:

Re: Manuscript No. 05-247 - The vertical and horizontal distribution of roots in northern hardwood stands of varying age by Ruth D. Yanai, Byung Bae Park, and Steven P. Hamburg

The above-noted manuscript may be acceptable for publication in the Canadian Journal of Forest Research after major revisions. In your revisions please pay careful attention to the enclosed comments of the referees and the Associate Editor. The revised manuscript will be carefully evaluated by the Associate Editor.

When you submit the revised manuscript, please include a cover letter, in which you quote the manuscript number, itemize each comment of the referees and the Associate Editor, describe in detail (with reference to page and line number in the revised manuscript) how you have addressed each of their comments in the revisions, and respond to those comments with which you disagree.

We prefer that you submit your revised manuscript by using our new on-line submission process located at:

<http://osprey.pubs.nrc-cnrc.gc.ca/publisher/access.view?journalCode=CJFR>

All other links you previously used should be deleted.

The revised manuscript must be returned to our office by September 15, 2005, or the manuscript will be considered withdrawn. You may also return the revised manuscript via courier or similar expedient means to avoid delays in the mail.



Your Submission

From: guy@interchange.ubc.ca  
To: <rdyanai@mailbox.syr.edu>  
Cc: <heinz.rennenberg@ctp.uni-freiburg.de>  
Subject: Your Submission  
Date: Wed, 20 Jun 2007 15:03:23 -0400

Ref.: Ms. No. TREES-D-07-00063  
Estimating nutrient uptake by mature tree roots under field conditions:  
challenges and opportunities  
Trees - Structure and Function

Dear Dr. Yanai,

Two referees have now commented on your paper. Their reviews (appended below) are quite favorable and, indeed, enthusiastic. Only minor revisions are required to make the manuscript suitable for publication.

In doing your revisions please submit a list of changes or other response to each point raised by the referees.

Your revision is due by 20-07-2007.

To submit a revision, go to <http://trees.edmgr.com/> and log in as an Author. You will see a menu item call Submission Needing Revision. You will find your submission record there.

Yours sincerely

Robert D. Guy  
Managing Editor  
Trees - Structure and Function

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: The manuscript (Review) "Estimating nutrient uptake by mature tree roots under field conditions: challenges and opportunities" by Lucash et al gives an overview on the different techniques applied for assessing nutrient transport in trees on the root level and intensively discusses the pros and cons of each approach.

I am looking forward to seeing this review published in TREES because it brings together for the first time the information on field uptake studies which try to directly address root processes.

Before publication, however, the authors should address the following points:

1) page 5 line 18: The author should point out here that the interactions





