From: **Robert D. Guy** <em@editorialmanager.com>
Date: Mon, Jul 17, 2023 at 6:40 PM
Subject: Your Submission - [EMID:d3a6a11919d30f3e]
To: nnnn

Ref.: Ms. No. TSAF-D-23-00193
Responses of stomatal density and carbon isotope composition to N, P, and Ca fertilization in sugar maple (Acer saccharum Marsh.) and yellow birch (Betula alleghaniensis Britton)
Trees

Dear,

Your manuscript has been initially reviewed by one of our expert Communicating Editors. You will see below that she has advised against publication of your work. Therefore I must reject it.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to consider your work.

Yours sincerely

Robert D. Guy
Editor-in-Chief
Trees

COMMENTS TO THE AUTHOR:

Dear,

Thank you very much for submitting your manuscript to Trees Structure and Function (TSAF).

I have evaluated your manuscript in detail and I do not find it suitable for publication in TSAF. The results presented in this manuscript are not particularly novel, nor of particular interest to the readers of TSAF. This work puts emphasis on the variance partitioning for stomatal traits, which is a pretty niche topic. That is why I think that your work would be better suited for a more specialized journal.

Other comments:

In your introduction, please state more specific aims/hypotheses guiding your experimental questions. It is clear that multiple environmental factors can influence stomatal density and/or length, but from species inter-comparison, we now that these are traits that are largely determined genetically (e.g. 10.1111/j.1469-8137.2008.02528.x). I suspect that the reader interested by your work would look for the novelty in your research question, which is not clearly stated here.
In your methods you need to indicate how d13C was measured and expressed. Consider shortening the part regarding data analyses.
On your results section, please report uncertainty (sd, se, cv or similar) of your estimated effects.

I hope you will find these comments useful,

Regards,

Dr Teresa E. Gimeno
Communicating Editor for TSAF