Dear Reviewer,

Thank you for taking the time and making the effort to review the paper entitled "Historical Precipitation pH Using Isotopic and Chemical Indices of Tree Rings of Pinus densiflora in Korea" by Kwak et al. The paper attempts to correlate environmental parameters with tree ring chemistry and to use these relationships to develop a model for reconstructing values of historic precipitation pH. I liked the paper and appreciate the approach taken by the authors; however, there are significant problems with the paper that must be addressed before it can be accepted for publication. In addition to these, I have also listed some minor improvements the authors should make to the re-submission while addressing the major problems.

Major Problems

There are three major problems with the paper which form the basis for the decision to request major revisions.

1 – An error on Figure 5a makes the derived correlation between tree ring d13C value and precipitation (pH) incorrect. The correlation on Figure 5a seems heavily influenced by a single data point at [H+] = 1.0 x 10^-6 M and d13C value of approximately -38.0 permil. This is the highest [H+] reported. From Figure 2a, the highest [H+] (1.0 x 10^-6 M) occurs in 2008. The tree ring d13C value for 2008 is approximately -27.0 permil.
From: foreco@elsevier.com  
Subject: Reviewer Notification of Editor Decision  
Date: December 14, 2007 7:04:20 PM EST  
To: Ruth Yanai

Ref: FOREC03342R1  
Title: Long-term effects of historical heathland farming on soil properties of forest ecosystems  
Article Type: PLA Full Length Article

Dear Dr. Ruth Yanai,

Thank you once again for reviewing the above-referenced paper. With your help the following final decision has now been reached:

Accepted

The author decision letter and reviewer reports can be found below.

We appreciate your time and effort in reviewing this paper and greatly value your assistance as a reviewer for Forest Ecology and Management.

If you have not yet activated or completed your 30 days of access to Scopus, you can still access Scopus via this link: http://scopese.elsevier.com/ees_login.asp?journalnym=FORECO&username=RDYANA1 You can use your EES password to access Scopus via the URL above. You can save your 30 days access period, but access will expire 6 months after you accepted to review.

Yours sincerely,

Peter Athwill  
Editor-in-Chief  
Forest Ecology and Management

To: "Goddet von Oheimb" vonoheimb@uni-lueneburg.de  
From: foreco@elsevier.com  
Subject: FOREC03342R1  
Ref: FOREC03342R1  
Title: Long-term effects of historical heathland farming on soil properties of forest ecosystems  
Authors: Goddet von Oheimb, PhD; Werner Härdie, Professor; Pascale S Naumann, MSc; Christina Westphal, PhD; Thorsten Assmann, Professor; Hartmut Moyer, MSc  
Submitted to Forest Ecology and Management

Article Type: PLA Full Length Article

Dear Dr. von Oheimb,

I am pleased to be able to inform you that the manuscript FOREC03342R1 has now been accepted for publication in Forest Ecology and Management. The manuscript will be transferred to our production department for preparation for press. Proofs will be sent to you in due course.

If there were any comments from the Editor and/or Reviewers, they can be found below.