Grading Rubric for Final Drafts (100 points)

Abstract
  - 10 All parts are complete, including the problem to be solved, objectives, results, and conclusions.
  - 9   Room for minor improvement or abstract unduly long.
  - 8   One part missing.
  - 6   Two parts missing.
  - 4   Three parts missing.

Introduction
  - 10 All of the following are present: (1) Why the problem is important, (2) The background necessary to understand the objectives, including relevant literature, (3) a clear statement of the objectives, and hypotheses if relevant. The reader's interest must be engaged.
  - 8   Missing one of the above characteristics
  - 6   Missing two of the above characteristics
  - 4   None of the necessary components are present

Methods
  - 10 The information provided is necessary and sufficient to reproduce the study and interpret the results.
  - 9   A few minor errors of omission, or a few extraneous things provided.
  - 8   Major errors of omission: statistical design absent or unclear, measurements not well described, or equations and parameter values absent.
  - 6   Multiple major errors of omission.
  - 4   I don't have a clue what was done and can't evaluate the paper.

Results
  - 10 Results are clear, complete, and substantial. The meaning is clear (relate results to your hypotheses).
  - 8   Minor errors, describing statistics instead of results, redundancy of tables, figures, and text.
  - 6   Multiple such errors, or serious flaws in analysis
  - 4   Results are very difficult to understand
  - 2   Results are incomprehensible

Discussion
  - 10 This section addresses the major issues raised in the paper, including sources of uncertainty, alternatives to choosing this approach, comparison to other studies, implications for the solving the problem posed in the introduction, and (if relevant) need for future research.
  - 8   Major areas are covered, but there are minor problems in a few sections
  - 6   One major area not addressed or multiple areas poorly addressed
  - 4   Several major areas not addressed
  - 2   There is little of value in this section

Figures and Tables (points off for failing to respond to lessons learned in our prior reviews)
- 10 Table and Figures are necessary, clear, and correctly formatted.
- 9 A few minor errors, such as gray scale, unnecessary outlines, labels or symbols too small, meaningless interpolation between points, poor resolution, or evidence of defaults from Excel.
- 8 Figures have major faults that make them difficult to understand.
- 6 Important figures lacking or many major errors.
- 4 Full of errors identified during class sessions but not remedied.

Organization
- 10 Material is presented in the correct section of the paper and paragraphs are well ordered and structured.
- 8 Two or three errors of organization (redundancy of sections, poor flow of content)
- 6 Material commonly found in the wrong place, but mostly in the right place.
- 4 Most material out of place or most paragraphs hard to follow.
- 2 It's hard to find a good paragraph in the right place.

Clarity of writing (points off for grammar, indirect language, wordiness, poor word choice)
- 10 Sentences are grammatically correct, concise, and easy to understand, words are appropriately used.
- 9 Writing is unduly wordy or frequent minor errors occur
- 8 Writing errors are common but not overwhelming.
- 6 More sentences have problems than do not.
- 4 It is hard to find an error-free sentence in this paper.

Importance of the Contribution
- 10 Novel, important, of interest to readers.
- 9 The contribution is solid but not so novel or exciting
- 8 Analysis was correct, but results were not well matched to the problem statement.
- 6 Methods were not appropriate to the problem, or analysis was not correct.
- 4 It is hard to find what is of value in this paper.

Other
Does your journal require keywords, suggested reviewers, links to supplementary material?
Provide no more than one page providing the material you will need for submitting your manuscript.
Title, keywords, author affiliations, references
- 10 All the information required by the target journal is provided in the desired format.
- 9 A few minor errors of omission, or a few extraneous things provided (check references!).
- 7 Major errors of omission
- 5 Multiple major errors of omission.
- 0 All absent